

# ROCK THE CAPITAL

## The Pay Raise 2005-2015

July 7, 2015

# Table of Contents

July 7, 2015

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| Table of Contents.....                                    | p. 1     |
| Introduction.....   | p. 2     |
| Background and Timeline.....                              | p. 3     |
| Legislative Compensation Packages: July 2005 vs 2015..... | p. 4-5   |
| Summary: House of Representatives.....                    | p. 6-10  |
| House of Representatives by the Numbers.....              | p. 11-39 |
| Summary of the Senate.....                                | p. 40    |
| Senate by the Numbers.....                                | p. 41-47 |
| Crime watch.....  | p. 48-57 |

## The Pay Raise Ten Years Later:

The Legislative Minimum Wage Has Increased 18% from \$69,648 to \$85,356

Rock the Capital released a review of current and former state legislators who accepted an increase in their pay through 'unvouchered expenses' and refused to pay the money back.

Legislators who refused to return unvouchered expenses, or donated the unconstitutional income to charities, have benefitted through increased wages, pension bounces in 2006 and 2008, and job promotions in 2009-2010. In 2007, five pay-jackers were appointed to the Speaker's Reform Commission.

Initially, 131 House members and 27 Senators signed up for unvouchered expenses. Payments were received between July 7 and November 16, 2005, and ranged from \$1,288 to \$14,553.32 (before taxes). The repealed pay raises would have boosted lawmakers' salaries from 16% to 54%, depending on seniority, rank, title and leadership.

By 2014, 54 current and former members of the House of Representatives and eight current and former members of the Senate accepted and benefitted from distribution of unvouchered expenses.

Base salaries in July 2005 for the rank and file-- excluding per diems, perks, public service announcements (PSAs), pensions and paid health insurance-- was **\$69,648**. The pay raise increased legislators' base pay to **\$81,050**, and many lawmakers received more money because of increased stipends for leadership or committee posts.

In the ten years since the pay raise, a freshman's minimum wage has increased by **\$15,664**. Rank and file legislators currently make **\$85,356** -- an increase of \$1,300 over the previous year -- but an increase of **\$15,708 in ten years**.

Moreover, the current backbench salary of **\$85,356** is **\$4,306** more a year than they would have received in 2005 if unvouchered expenses had been deemed illegal. There are eleven active pay-jackers in the House of Representatives, including four members who are or have been investigated by law enforcement agencies. In the Senate, there are five active pay-jackers, including one member who entered into a settlement with the State Ethics Commission.

## Background and Timeline

July 7, 2005

The Pennsylvania House and Senate passed Act 44 at 2 a.m., increasing the salaries of officials in all three branches of government without public hearings, public debate or public knowledge.

Governor Edward G. Rendell signed the bill that evening, and told the media the following day, "It's legal ['unvouchered expenses'] and that's all I'm going to say about it."

The base salary on July 7, 2005 for the rank and file was \$69,648, excluding per diems, perks, PSAs, pensions and paid health insurance. The pay raise "...increased legislators' base pay to \$81,050 - more than any other state except California - and most lawmakers received more money because of expanded stipends in the bill for leadership or committee posts. Individual members saw raises ranging from 16 to 54 percent."

November 16, 2005

As a result of public pressure, the General Assembly and Gov. Rendell passed Act 72 of 2005, repealing the raise. However, Act 72 did not require those who had received increased salaries to return the funds.

In total, 158 lawmakers accepted the raise. Numerous legislators have opted not to repay the unvouchered expenses, or donated the money to charity. These amounts can be applied toward pension calculations and verified through the State Employees' Retirement System.

September 14, 2006

The Pennsylvania Supreme Court ruled that unvouchered expenses violated the state constitution, but did not order recipients to pay the money back. The Court also reinstated the pay raises for themselves and approximately 1,200 judges.

## Legislative Compensation Packages:

July 7, 2005 vs July 7, 2015

- The base salary in July 2005 for rank and file members-- excluding per diems, perks, PSAs, pensions and paid health insurance-- was **\$69,648**.
- Lawmakers automatically receive pay increases, or COLAs, on December 1st. The “shared sacrifice” budget of 2014 allows legislators to keep their COLAs, per diems and “seasonal per diems.”
- The base salary for 2015 **increased** to **\$85,356**. The annual salary does not include the cost for health care, parking, per diems, perks, PSAs, pensions or health insurance.
- Retired lawmakers are entitled to lifetime health care for themselves and their spouses.
- Retired legislators are reimbursed for their **monthly Medicare payment**. When a lawmaker turns 65, they are entitled to Medicare (there are exceptions not listed here). They sign up through Social Security and the payment, currently at \$104.90, is deducted directly from their Social Security check every month. The \$104.90 is adjusted upwards if the recipient has income in retirement over \$85,000- single and \$170,000- joint (there are four different brackets).
- **The median household income for Pennsylvania in 2005** was **\$53,143** and per capita income was just under **\$30,000**.
- **The median household income for Pennsylvania in 2013** was **\$52,007** or a three year change of -1.24%. The per capita income was **\$28,647** for a three year increase of 1.66%.
- The 2012 budget included **\$1.7 million in health care subsidies** for legislators’ prescription medicine and dental benefits. Lawmakers pay 1% of their salaries toward health benefits. House members and their families cost taxpayers between **\$4,543 to \$20,420 for health care per member, per year**. State senators and their families’ costs range from **\$6,969 to \$19,311** (“The Pennsylvania Independent,” July 3, 2012).

- A **per diem** is an undocumented reimbursement lawmakers receive, in addition to their salary, for food and lodging. If a per diem is taken on a session day or for a committee meeting, **taxes are not taken out**. If a legislator receives a per diem for a non-session day, **taxes are taken out**.
- Some legislators have used per diems to purchase second homes.
- The per diem rate was **\$141** in **2006**. The current state reimbursement rate is **\$159** from September through May. The actual per diem reimbursements can float to **\$163** in the summer months.
- In 2013, state lawmakers charged taxpayers for 14,822 per diems, totaling **\$2.1 million**, according to a Morning Call investigation.
- “All told, the state's 253 full-time lawmakers charged taxpayers **\$13.8 million** in reimbursable expenses, including the per diems, between Jan. 1st and Dec. 31st, 2013,” a Morning Call analysis of spending records shows. (“The Morning Call,” Steve Esack and Eugene Tauber, November 17, 2014).
- The legislature’s actual budget in **2004-2005** was **\$340.9 million**. The legislature’s slush fund stood at **\$135 million**, and these tax dollars were used to pay for unvouchered expenses.
- The legislature had \$475.9 million at their disposal in 2005.
- In 2014, the legislature spent **\$313.4 million** after **Governor Corbett cut \$65 million** from the legislature's \$337.6 million budget. The legislature is pursuing restitution from Commonwealth Court by suing to recoup **\$72.2 million**.
- Governor Wolf has committed to **increase legislative funding by 21%** for a **\$329 appropriation in 2015-2016**. Depending on the outcome of budget negotiations and the Commonwealth Court ruling, the legislature will be allocated **\$329 million** and possibly have as much as **\$401.2 million on hand**, and still have a **surplus of \$161 million**.
- The legislature’s non-lapsing slush funds grew from **\$154 million** to **\$161 million** over the last year, and increased by **\$26 million** since 2005.

## Summary: House of Representatives

### Act 140: Forfeiture of pensions: (4)

- Former Rep. Bill DeWeese, (D-Greene)
- Former Rep. John Perzel, (R-Philadelphia) \*
- Former Rep. Stephen Stetler, (D-York) (1)
- Former Rep. Mike Veon, (D-Beaver) \*

### Active Members of the House: (11)

- Rep. Louise Williams Bishop, (D-Philadelphia) (2)
- Rep. Mark Cohen, (D-Philadelphia)
- Rep. Angel Cruz, (D-Philadelphia)
- Rep. Dwight Evans, (D-Philadelphia) (3)
- Rep. Bill Keller, (D-Philadelphia). (4)
- Rep. Thaddeus Kirkland, (D-Delaware) (5)
- Rep. Chris Sainato, (D-Lawrence) (6)
- Rep. Mike Sturla, (D-Lancaster)
- Rep. John Taylor, (R-Philadelphia)
- Rep. W. Curtis Thomas, (D-Philadelphia)
- Rep. Rosita Youngblood, (D-Philadelphia)

### Defeated: Activated Pensions, (11)

- Former Rep. Fred Belardi, (D-Lackawana)
- Former Rep. Todd Eachus, (D-Luzerne)
- Former Rep. Teresa Forcier, (R-Crawford)
- Former Rep. Rick Geist, (R-Blair)
- Former Rep. Harold James, (D-Philadelphia) (7)
- Former Rep. Babette Josephs, (D-Philadelphia)
- Former Rep. Frank LaGrotta, (D-Lawrence)
- Former Rep. Stephen Maitland, (R-Adams)
- Former Rep. Ken Ruffing, (D-Allegheny)
- Former Rep. John Perzel, (R-Philadelphia.) \*
- Former Rep. Mike Veon, (D-Beaver.) \*

---

### Defeated: Not vested, (1)

- Former Rep. Tommie Blackwell, (D-Philadelphia)

### Gaming Control Board Member: (1)

- Former Rep. Keith McCall, (D-Carbon)

### Resigned after plea bargain:

- Rep. Ronald Waters, (D-Philadelphia) (8)

### Retired with Pension: (6)

- Former Rep. Robert Donatucci, (D-Philadelphia) (Deceased)
- Former Rep. Harold James, (D-Philadelphia) (7)
- Former Rep. John Myers, (D-Philadelphia)
- Former Rep. Frank Oliver, (D-Philadelphia)
- Former Rep. Edward Staback, (D-Lackawanna)
- Former Rep. Jewell Williams, (D-Philadelphia)

### Retired with “Pension Bounce”: (25)

- Former Rep. Linda Bebeko-Jones, (D-Erie) (Deceased)
- Former Rep. Alfred Belardi, (D-Lackawanna)
- Former Rep. Kevin D. Blaum, (D-Luzerne)
- Former Rep. Gaynor Cawley, (D- Lackawanna)
- Former Rep. Thomas C. Corrigan, Sr., (D-Bucks)
- Former Rep. Jacqueline R. Crahalla, (R- Montgomery)
- Former Rep. Robert Flick, (R-Chester)
- Former Rep. Teresa Forcier, (R-Crawford)
- Former Rep. Mike Gruitza, (D-Mercer)
- Former Rep. George C. Hasay, (R-Luzerne)
- Former Rep. Frank LaGrotta, (D-Lawrence)
- Former Rep. Harold James, (D-Philadelphia) (7)
- Former Rep. George Kenney, (R-Philadelphia)
- Former Rep. Marie A. Lederer, (D- Philadelphia)
- Former Rep. Victor John Lescovitz, (D-Washington & Allegheny)
- Former Rep. Stephen Maitland, (R-Adams)
- Former Rep. Sheila Miller, (R-Berks)
- Former Rep. William W. Rieger, (D-Philadelphia) (Deceased)
- Former Rep. Lawrence Roberts, (D-Fayette)
- Former Rep. T.J. Rooney, (D-Northampton)
- Former Rep. Ken Ruffing, (D-Allegheny)
- Former Rep. James Shaner, (D-Fayette) (Deceased)
- Former Rep. Stephen Stetler, (D-York) (1)
- Former Rep. Thomas M. Tigue, (D-Luzerne)
- Former Rep. Elinor Z. Taylor, (R-Chester) (Deceased)



## Notes

1 Mr. Stetler collected an annual sum of \$45,516 through April 2011. He was able to keep his lump sum payment of \$75,758, but had to forfeit his annual annuity after a criminal conviction. (RTK Request, April 18, 2011)

2 As part of a Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's sting operation, four state representatives were allegedly caught on tape taking money: Ronald Waters, who allegedly accepted multiple payments totaling \$7,650; Vanessa Brown, who allegedly took \$4,000; Michelle Brownlee, who allegedly received \$3,500; and Louise Bishop, who allegedly accepted \$1,500, and a former Traffic Court judge, Thomasine Tynes.

Philadelphia State Representatives Ronald Waters, Vanessa Lowery Brown, and former State Representative Harold James entered pleas to accepting cash in violation of state ethics laws, resulting from a sting operation by a lobbyist informant. Waters resigned his House seat on June 1, 2015, and plead guilty to nine counts of conflict of interest. James also pled guilty to one count of the same and both will serve probation.

**Update:** “A judge on Friday rejected a request that he dismiss bribery and other charges against State Rep. Louise Williams Bishop in the sting investigation after her lawyer argued that the case was too old and Bishop's memory too weak.

“Dauphin County Court Judge Scott Evans also turned down Bishop's bid to have any potential trial held in Philadelphia, saying he did not have the authority to make that decision.

“Evans did not rule on Bishop's contention that prosecutors in the sting operation selected their targets based on race and that as a consequence, the entire case should be thrown out.

“Bishop, 81, is among six current or former Democratic elected officials from Philadelphia who were charged with taking money from a lobbyist who sought political and legislative favors. Two former legislators have pleaded guilty, as has a former Traffic Court judge. A fourth is scheduled to appear in court on Monday. All six are black.” (“Philadelphia Inquirer,” Angela Couloumbis and Craig R. McCoy, June 7, 2015).

3 “A Philadelphia nonprofit with ties to State Rep. Dwight Evans mismanaged \$1.5 million in state grants since 2006, raising questions about how the money was obtained and spent, according to a confidential state audit. At Evans' direction, the Urban Affairs Coalition put a Philadelphia pastor and his aide on its payroll, the auditors found, then used

taxpayer funds to pay them \$365,000 for work that auditors said they could not verify.” (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, John P. Martin and Angela Couloumbis, November 18, 2012).

“The state investigation ended last year with OARC admitting no wrongdoing but agreeing to return \$1.2 million in taxpayer funds and forgoing an additional \$1.8 million that had already been approved. OARC remains eligible for future funding...

“Evans founded OARC 30 years ago to advance community development in West Oak Lane, which is in the heart of his district. He is credited with using his position as chairman of the House Appropriations Committee to direct more than \$29 million in state aid to the nonprofit since 2000...

“The FBI's interest in OARC was confirmed by Meadow, Travick, Germantown publisher Jim Foster, and a Mount Airy property owner who declined to be identified...

“A confidential report prepared for the state Inspector General's Office alleged that OARC had misspent or mismanaged portions of state grants worth \$12 million since 2006. Investigators concluded that OARC violated bidding rules, made questionable property purchases, and improperly shifted or used grant money between 2006 and 2011...” (*Philadelphia Inquirer*,” Chris Hepp, August 18, 2014).

4 “It has been nearly 2.5 years since teams of FBI and IRS agents raided homes and offices in Pennsport connected with state Rep. Bill Keller. So far, three of the 11-term state legislator's close allies have been indicted.” (*Daily News*, January 31, 2013).

**April 24, 2013:** “The former chief of staff to state Rep. Bill Keller and a longtime business partner for the 11-term legislator pleaded guilty in federal court Wednesday to financial crimes in separate cases. The *Daily News* predicted those pleas in a story Wednesday.

“Lorraine DiSpaldo, who was forced to retire after being indicted with Traffic Court Judge Robert Mulgrew and his wife on Sept. 13, pleaded guilty to 36 counts for misusing state grant money meant for two non-profits in Keller's district and for filing false income tax returns and bankruptcy court filings. Assistant U.S. Attorney Paul Gray said DiSpaldo improperly spent \$70,000 to \$120,000 in state grant money and hid \$46,779 in income from 2006 to 2009.” (“*Daily News*,” Chris Brennan, April 24, 2013).

5 Mr. Kirkland is “under investigation by the state Ethics Commission, apparently in connection with a tangled web of money and potential conflicts of interest that he helped weave from Harrisburg. The *Daily News* reported in November that since 1998, about \$800,000 in state grants has gone to organizations close to Kirkland's family - including the Baptist church where he is pastor, an annual cultural festival at which his daughter has been paid to sing and an arts center where his wife is president and his son-in-law was executive director.” (*Daily News* Wednesday, February 13, 2013.)

**Update:** On November 20, 2014, “the Ethics Commission and Mr. Kirkland entered into a Consent Agreement that stipulated Thaddeus Kirkland, D-Delaware County, violated the ethics law by funneling a legislative initiative grant to a nonprofit affiliated with his family. It announced a ‘consent agreement’ in which Mr. Kirkland was to pay \$2,000 in restitution for \$2,000 paid to his daughter. Another stipulation was that ‘Kirkland is directed to not accept any reimbursement, compensation or other payment from the Pennsylvania House of Representatives representing a full or partial reimbursement of the amount paid in settlement of this matter.’” (Pittsburgh Post Gazette,” Joe Smydo, December 22, 2014).

6 Rep. Chris Sainato, (D-Lawrence) was the Per Diem King in 2014. “The Lawrence County Democrat raked in 192 per diem reimbursements totaling \$29,254, records show.” (“The Morning Call,” Steve Esack and Eugene Tauber, November 17, 2014).

## House of Representatives by the Numbers

The following former and current House members have refused to return the unvouchered expenses, or donated the unconstitutional income to charities.

- **Former Rep. Linda Bebko-Jones, (D-Erie.)**

Rep. Bebko-Jones was elected in 1992, and withdrew from the primary in 2006 after questions were raised about the validity of her signatures.

Rep. Bebko-Jones pled guilty to charges that she forged signatures on her nominating petitions.

Ms. Bebko-Jones voted for the pay raise and the pension increase. She also received Jones received a “pension bounce.”

Monthly pension: \$2,581.29.

Lump-sum withdrawal: \$65,55.51.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, July 24, 2012.)

Rep. Bebko-Jones passed away on November 20, 2011.

- **Former Rep. Alfred Belardi, (D-Lackawanna.)**

Mr. Belardi served in the House of Representatives from 1979 to 2006. He voted for pay raise and the pension increase, and was defeated for supporting the 2005 legislative pay raise. Mr. Belardi “kept the pay raise and put in for 216 per diems in 18 months and took home an additional \$29,052 before leaving office.” (*Shamrock Times*, November 14, 2006).

**Golden parachute:** “Mr. Belardi was given a six-week, \$10,000 consulting job to help his successor as Democratic caucus administrator learn that job” (*Daily Review*, March 14, 2007). He was listed as a House employee making \$116,826 a year as Director of Member Services. (*Pittsburgh Post Gazette*, February 7, 2009).

He also voted to increase his pension 2001, and received a “pension bounce.”

Monthly pension: \$5,800.91.

Lump-sum withdrawal: \$158,606.34. 14

(SERS Response to RTK Request, April 23, 2012.)

- **Rep. Louise Williams Bishop, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Rep. Bishop voted for the raise, then voted to repeal the raise, but still kept the money. She also voted for the pension increase in 2001

**Crime watch:** “As part of a Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's sting operation, four state representatives were allegedly caught on tape taking money: Ronald Waters, who allegedly accepted multiple payments totaling \$7,650; Vanessa Brown, who allegedly took \$4,000; Michelle Brownlee, who allegedly received \$3,500; and Louise Bishop, who allegedly accepted \$1,500, and a former Traffic Court judge, Thomasine Tynes.

**Update:** “A judge on Friday rejected a request that he dismiss bribery and other charges against State Rep. Louise Williams Bishop in the sting investigation after her lawyer argued that the case was too old and Bishop's memory too weak.

“Dauphin County Court Judge Scott Evans also turned down Bishop's bid to have any potential trial held in Philadelphia, saying he did not have the authority to make that decision.

“Evans did not rule on Bishop's contention that prosecutors in the sting operation selected their targets based on race and that as a consequence, the entire case should be thrown out.

“Bishop, 81, is among six current or former Democratic elected officials from Philadelphia who were charged with taking money from a lobbyist who sought political and legislative favors.” (“Philadelphia Inquirer,” Angela Coulombis and Craig R. McCoy, June 7, 2015).

- **Former Rep. Tommie Blackwell, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Blackwell held office from 2005-2008. He was defeated in the Democratic primary of 2008. Mr. Blackwell voted to increase his salary 22% from \$69,648 to \$85,102 and kept the money.

“Mr. Blackwell is a Vestee, meaning he has terminated his State service and has left his accumulated deductions in the SERS’ Fund and has not applied for a retirement benefits.” (SERS Response to RTK Request, June 30 2014.)

- **Former Rep. Kevin Blaum, (D-Luzerne.)**

Mr. Blaum served in the House of Representatives from 1981 to 2006. He voted for the pension increase, and was forced out of office after supporting the 2005 legislative pay raise.

Rep. Blaum also voted to increase his pension, and received a “pension bounce.”

Monthly pension: \$4,578.53.

Full lump-sum withdrawal: \$115,132.50.

*The Associated Press*, February 8, 2007.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

- **Former Rep. Gaynor Cawley, (D- Lackawanna.)**

Mr. Cawley served in the House of Representatives from 1981-2006. Not only did he vote for and take the “unconstitutional raise”, Mr. Cawley was the largest recipient of per diems from 2004-2005, accruing \$53,030.

Mr. Cawley was forced to retire after supporting the 2005 legislative pay raise.

He also voted to increase his pension, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,241.55.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$113,325.47.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

- **Rep. Mark Cohen, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Cohen was elected in 1978. He served as the Majority Caucus Chairman from 1990-1992, Majority Whip from 1993-1994, Democratic Caucus Chairman from 1994-2006, and Majority Caucus Chairman from 2007 to 2010.

He voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, then took the money. Rep Cohen collected \$46,270 in per diems between 2004-2005, and read 800 books at a cost to tax payers of \$28,200. (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, April 2, 2006)

**History lesson:** “...go back to 1990 when the *Daily News*' John Baer reported that Cohen had racked up expenses of \$104,000 in a 20-month period. Put Cohen in a blond wig, hand him a Chihuahua and you've got Paris Hilton.” (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, June 11, 2007)

**Credit rating:** “Rep. Mark Cohen, (D-Philadelphia), revealed a credit card balance with a 24.99 percent interest rate and that he accepted an interest-free loan from his longtime administrative assistant, Dorothy Kelly. ‘She was aware that I was shopping around for a

loan, and she offered to pay, she offered to loan me the money,' Cohen said. He has since repaid the loan, which was for slightly more than \$6,500,' he said." (*Associated Press*, May 4, 2007, Source: Statement of Financial Interests for 2006, State Ethics Commission)

**Taxpayer funded education:** While serving as a full-time legislator Mr. Cohen completed graduate work at Temple University, Gratz College and Pennsylvania State University, received a law degree from the Widener School of Law and an MBA from Lebanon Valley College in 2000.

**Up-in-smoke:** "Rep. Mark Cohen (D-Philadelphia) spent a day talking policy and strategy in New York City with the International Cannabis Association, an event he valued at \$499." ("Associated Press," Mark Scolforo, May 16, 2015).

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

• **Former Rep. Tom Corrigan, (D-Bucks.)**

Mr. Corrigan served in the House of Representatives from 1986 to 2006, and was forced to retire for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005. He also voted for the pension increase.

**Mannerisms:** "Rep. Thomas C. Corrigan Sr. (D., Bucks) hung up on a reporter when asked whether he would return the money he collected in 'unvouchered expenses.'" (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, September 16, 2006).

**Taxpayer travel:** Mr. Corrigan also attended legislative training conferences as a lame duck lawmaker.

**Lifetime pension bounce:** "Mr. Corrigan retired with an extra \$1,280 after taking the \$3,801 pay raise." (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, March 26, 2006).

Mr. Corrigan voted to increase his pension in 2001.

Monthly pension: \$2,289.07.

Lump-sum withdrawal: \$102,897.47.

(SERS, Right-to-Know Request, July 19, 2010.)

- **Former Rep. Jacqueline R. Crahalla, (R- Montgomery.)**

Rep. Crahalla defended the pay raise, "I think this is fair compensation for the amount of hours we put in," said state Rep. Jacqueline R. Crahalla, R-150th Dist., noting she routinely works 50-plus hour weeks.

"This job is tough and, every two years, your reputation gets knocked to hell if you are seeking re-election, and there is no job security," said Crahalla, adding that municipal administrators often get paid more and have better job security than state lawmakers." ("The Times Herald," August 21, 2005).

She added, "I'm doing it because I think it is right, because we deserve it,"

Rep. Jacqueline R. Crahalla (R- Montgomery) retired with a \$190 pension bounce for taking the pay raise. After four years of service, she'll receive \$8,500 annually. (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, March 26, 2006.)

Rep. Jacqueline R. Crahalla (R-Montgomery), retiring after four years, said there are some things she will not miss. "It seems we sit here for hours, here in Harrisburg, waiting for the decisions of leadership," she said. "I've never been blessed with patience, and the sitting has been very trying." ("The Associated Press, Mark Scolforo, November 26, 2006).

**Monthly pension:** \$553.

**Approximate lump-sum withdrawal:** \$22,000.

(*The Associated Press*, February 8, 2007.)

- **Rep. Angel Cruz, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Cruz voted for the raise, then voted to repeal the raise and took the money.

He also voted for the pension increase in 2001, five months after being elected.

**"Cake and eat it too":** Rep. Cruz told *RTC* the night of the pay raise repeal vote that he was waiting to collect pension and health benefits before running for a higher paying job on City Council. He was seen eating cake with members from the Philadelphia delegation on the House floor on June 21, 2007, thus proving that you can have your cake and eat it too.



- **Former Rep. Bill DeWeese, (D-Greene.)**

Mr. DeWeese supported the pay raise and demoted party members in leadership positions who voted against the pay raise. Mr. DeWeese received over \$13,000 in unvouchered expenses with which he sent eight \$1,000 checks to each school district in Greene County, and paid \$5,000 in federal income taxes.

**Slush fund:** Mr. DeWeese accessed a \$13 million “special leadership account” to fly to Santa Barbara, California, pay a personal driver, and spend \$149,105 in advertising and \$254,722 on consulting fees. (*Herald-Standard*, May 12, 2006).

He also voted for the pension increase in 2001.

**Polling for dollars:** In 2007, House Majority Leader Bill DeWeese authorized \$289,759 for political polling. (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, November 25, 2007).

**Sentence:** The former House Majority was sentenced to 2.5 to 5 years in prison after being convicted on five felonies for using his Harrisburg and district office staff to for political advancement. Judge Todd Hoover also ordered Mr. DeWeese to pay \$25,000 in fines and court costs and almost \$116,000 in restitution.

**Pension:** Mr. DeWeese was stripped of his annual pension by the State Employees’ Retirement System. His annual pension was estimated to be almost \$120,000 annually.

**Update:** Former Speaker Bill DeWeese was released from the Retreat State Correctional facility in March, 2014, and is currently on parole.

**Appeal:** “More than two years after he was convicted and eight months after his release from prison, former state House Speaker Bill DeWeese is asking for a new trial in the public corruption case that torpedoed his political career.

“In an appeal filed in Dauphin County Court this week, the former Greene County legislator contends that he should have been allowed to present 17 more defense witnesses during his 2012 trial.

“Also, DeWeese contends that his former lawyer, William C. Costopoulos, one of the area's premier defense attorneys, didn't effectively represent him against accusations that he had his legislative staff do election campaigning on state-paid time. The attorney general's office contended the crimes occurred from 2001-06, while DeWeese, a Democrat, was House minority leader.” “Penn Live,” Matt Miller, November 28, 2014).

- **Former Rep. Robert Donatucci, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. represented the 185 Legislative District from 1980-2010. Mr. Donatucci served in the House of Representatives from 1980 until his death in November 2010. He voted for the raise, then voted to repeal the raise, and took the money. He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

He passed away on November 9, 2010. He was succeeded by his wife Maria Donatucci in 2011.

- **Former Rep. Todd Eachus, (D-Luzerne.)**

Mr. Eachus was the former Democratic Party Leader and served in the House of Representatives from 1997 to 2010. Mr. Eachus voted to increase his salary 22% from \$69,648 to \$85,102 and kept the money.

**Taxpayer investment property:** “Eachus, D-116, and his wife, Ellen, own a two-story brick townhouse listed as commercial property with apartments at 225 South St., near the Capitol building. They bought it for \$125,000 on Aug. 30, 2005, and have a \$100,000, 30-year mortgage on it. The previous owner paid \$82,000 for it at a 1996 sheriff's sale. The property is also listed as a source of income on Eachus' 2008 financial interest statement.” (*Shamrock Times*, Borys Krawczeniuk & Robert Swift, February 21, 2010).

**Law suit:** On March 17, 2012, in the U.S. District Court for the Middle District of Pennsylvania, “Former Majority Leader Todd Eachus of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives and seven staff members of the House Democratic Caucus have been sued by the former controller of the caucus who claims she was fired for testifying about the scandal known as Bonusgate.”

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001. After 13 years of public service, Mr. Eachus began collecting a pension at age 50.

**Monthly pension:** \$2,684.30.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$96,478.99.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, December 18, 2012.)

• **Rep. Dwight Evans, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Evans was elected in 1981 and was the former Chairman of the House Appropriations Committee. He voted for the pay raise, then voted to repeal the raise, and still took the money.

Mr. Evans also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Nonprofit:** “Six Pennsylvania lawmakers have steered almost \$29 million in taxpayer money to nonprofit groups controlled, created or fostered by those same politicians...In Northwest Philadelphia, Evans incorporated the Ogontz Avenue Revitalization Corporation with several constituents in 1983. Evans has helped the corporation snare three dozen state grants worth about \$5.7 million since 1990, but has no direct role in operations. (*Pittsburgh Tribune Review*, Brad Bumsted and Debra Erdley, April 24, 2006).

**Time out:** “A Philadelphia nonprofit with ties to State Rep. Dwight Evans mismanaged \$1.5 million in state grants since 2006, raising questions about how the money was obtained and spent, according to a confidential state audit. At Evans' direction, the Urban Affairs Coalition put a Philadelphia pastor and his aide on its payroll, the auditors found, then used taxpayer funds to pay them \$365,000 for work that auditors said they could not verify.” (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, John P. Martin and Angela Couloumbis, November 18, 2012).

**Update:** “The state investigation ended last year with OARC admitting no wrongdoing but agreeing to return \$1.2 million in taxpayer funds and forgoing an additional \$1.8 million that had already been approved. OARC remains eligible for future funding...

“Evans founded OARC 30 years ago to advance community development in West Oak Lane, which is in the heart of his district. He is credited with using his position as chairman of the House Appropriations Committee to direct more than \$29 million in state aid to the nonprofit since 2000...

“The FBI's interest in OARC was confirmed by Meadow, Travick, Germantown publisher Jim Foster, and a Mount Airy property owner who declined to be identified...

“A confidential report prepared for the state Inspector General's Office alleged that OARC had misspent or mismanaged portions of state grants worth \$12 million since 2006. Investigators concluded that OARC violated bidding rules, made questionable property purchases, and improperly shifted or used grant money between 2006 and 2011...” (“*Philadelphia Inquirer*,” Chris Hepp, August 18, 2014).

• **Former Rep. Robert Flick, (R-Chester.)**

Rep. Flick voted for the pay raise and kept the unvouchered expenses, voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Exit strategy:** “Rep. Robert Flick, R-Chester, retiring after 24 years in the House, told reporters who, he said, "suckle" at the breasts of "disgruntled lawmakers," to get both a life and a real job. He didn't return phone messages seeking clarification. (“The Associated Press, Mark Scolforo, November 26, 2006).

**Pension bounce:** Rep. Robert J. Flick (R-Chester) will collect...an additional \$1,900 per year for not refunding the unvouchered expenses. (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, March 26, 2006).

**Monthly pension:** \$3,183.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$106,685.82. (Full withdrawal.)  
(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Former Rep. Teresa Forcier, (R-Crawford.)**

Rep. Forcier served in the House of Representatives from 1991 to 2006. She was defeated in the 2006 primary after supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

Rep. Forcier voted ‘no’ on the pay-raise bill, but accepted the unvouchered expenses. *RTC* spoke with her staff on May 3, 2006, and is still awaiting staff response on repayment terms. On March 3, 2006, Rep. Forcier stated she would not violate the privacy of the three-dozen charities [to which] she gave \$5,400. “This is a reversal of her [previous] decision to release the information.” (*Meadeville Tribune*, March 3, 2006).

• **Former Rep. Teresa Forcier, (R-Crawford.)**

Ms. Forcier voted for the pension increase, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$2,768.37.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$83,972.04.  
(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Former Rep. Rick Geist, (R-Blair.)**

Mr. Geist was elected to office in 1979, and served as the chairman of the Transportation Committee. He was defeated in Blair County by talk host and college professor, John McGinnis, in 2012.

Mr. Geist voted for the pay raise, accepted unvouchered expenses, and also voted for the pension increase in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$5,395.18.

**Partial lump-sum withdrawal:** \$3,381.09.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, December 11, 2012.)

• **Former Rep. Mike Gruitza, (D-Mercer.)**

Mr. Gruitza served in the House of Representatives from 1981 to 2006, and retired after supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

Pay raise: Mr. Gruitza voted for the pay raise, accepted unvouchered expenses, and spent the raise on chimney work. "It's not worth the aggravation," Gruitza said. "I feel bad that there is a sense out there that you are just trying to take care of yourself, when all these years my main priority has been helping others." (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, December 1, 2005).

Mr. Gruitza voted for the pension increase, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,466.29.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$113,325.47.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Rep. Gary Haluska, (D-Cambria.)**

Mr. Haluska was elected to the House of Representatives since 1995, and retired from the legislature in 2014.

He voted against the pay raise, but took the unconstitutional money. His capitol office (787-3532) referred *RTC* to the district office at 814-674-8939. On May 3, 2006, Mr. Haluska told *RTC* that he donated the entire amount to local food banks as he did in 1995 when he first arrived in the House.

Mr. Haluska voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,278.04

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$134,027.72

(SERS RTK Request data received on June 30, 2015.)

• **Former Rep. George C. Hasay, (R-Luzerne.)**

Mr. Hasay served in the House of Representatives from 1973 to 2006. Mr. Hasay voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Pay raise:** Mr. Hasay voted for the pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. He retired with a pension bounce.

Mr. Hasay confessed, "I spent 34 years in public service, and when I first ran for the job, I never even thought about the pension plan or anything like that," said former state Rep. George C. Hasay..." (*Morning Call*, Bill White Blog, February 9, 2007).

That's interesting because in 2001, Mr. Hasay voted to increase his pension.

Rep. George C. Hasay (R-Luzerne) will reap a pension bounce of \$5,400 to \$77,600 for taking the money. (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, March 26, 2006).

**Monthly pension:** \$6,587.41.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$329,000.

(Associated Press, February 8, 2007.)

• **Former Rep. Harold James, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Rep. James served in the House of Representatives from January 3, 1989 to November 30, 2008, and from May 8, 2012 through 2013. Mr. James was defeated in the 2008 primary by Kenyatta Johnson but was reelected in 2012.

Mr. James voted for the pay hike, voted to repeal the raise, and took the money. "The only lawmaker who appeared conflicted [after the Supreme Court decision] about what to do was Rep. Harold James (D., Phila.) James said yesterday that he would seek the advice of House leadership and counsel before making a decision. Still, he stressed: 'I earned it and I worked for it.'" (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, *Inquirer* September 16, 2006).

Mr. James voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Update:** Philadelphia State Representatives Ronald Waters, Vanessa Lowery Brown, and former State Representative Harold James entered pleas for accepting cash in violation of state ethics laws, resulting from a sting operation by a lobbyist informant. Waters resigned his House seat on June 1, 2015, and plead guilty to nine counts of conflict of interest. James also pled guilty to one count of the same and both will serve probation.

**Monthly pension:** \$2,829.22.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$106,435.93.

(RTK Request, August 11, 2011)

• **Former Rep. Rep. Babette Josephs, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Representative Josephs served in the House of Representatives from 1985 to 2012. She was defeated in the 2012 Democratic primary. She voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and donated the money to charity, but never paid it back.

Ms. Joseph's voted to increase her pension in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$5,271.70.

**Approximate lump-sum withdrawal:** \$0.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, December 11, 2012.)

• **Rep. Bill Keller, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Keller has served in the House of Representatives since 1993 and voted to increase his pension in 2001. Mr. Keller voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and took the money.

**Crime watch:** On August 18, 2010, "Action News has learned that federal authorities conducted raids this morning involving Pa. State Representative William Keller. Federal investigators carted out files and cases from a home in Rose Valley, Delaware County. The house belongs to Marty O'Rourke, a campaign aide to State Representative Bill Keller. (WPVI, *Offices of State Rep., staffer and judge raided.*)

**Update:** "It has been nearly 2.5 years since teams of FBI and IRS agents raided homes and offices in Pennsport connected with state Rep. Bill Keller. So far, three of the 11-term state legislator's close allies have been indicted." (*Daily News*, January 31, 2013).

**April 24, 2013:** "The former chief of staff to state Rep. Bill Keller and a longtime business partner for the 11-term legislator pleaded guilty in federal court Wednesday to financial crimes in separate cases. The Daily News predicted those pleas in a story Wednesday.

"Lorraine DiSpaldo, who was forced to retire after being indicted with Traffic Court Judge Robert Mulgrew and his wife on Sept. 13, pleaded guilty to 36 counts for misusing state grant money meant for two non-profits in Keller's district and for filing false income tax returns and bankruptcy court filings. Assistant U.S. Attorney Paul Gray said DiSpaldo improperly spent \$70,000 to \$120,000 in state grant money and hid \$46,779 in income from 2006 to 2009." ("*Daily News*," Chris Brennan, April 24, 2013).

Mr. Keller voted to increase his pension in 2001.

- **Former Rep. George Kenney, (R-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Kenney voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and took the money. Mr. Kenney vacated his seat in 2008.

**“Ghost” Landlord:** “It was 2006, and [Sue] Cornell, a freshman state representative, had just been booted from office by Montgomery County voters, and she needed a job. She turned to the person who had recruited her to run - then-Speaker John M. Perzel. Perzel found her work, assigning her to the office of his fellow Philadelphia Republican, then-Rep. George Kenney, for the same \$72,187 salary she had as a legislator. For a month and a half, Cornell collected a state paycheck without doing any work or setting foot in Kenney's office.” (*Philadelphia Inquirer*, November 22, 2009).

He voted to increase his pension in 2001, and received a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,441.13

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$129,845.49.

(SERS, Right-to-Know Request, July 19, 2010.)

- **Rep. Thaddeus Kirkland, (D-Delaware.)**

Mr. Kirkland has served in the House of Representatives since 1993.

Rep. Kirkland also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

He voted to increase his salary 22% from \$69,648 to \$85,102, and kept the money. “I will take my pay raise and I appreciate the opportunity to take that pay raise,” he said. “When I get an increase in pay, the more I do for my community. The more I get, the more I give.” (*Montgomery Media Publications*, Danielle Lynch, November 21, 2012).

**Ethics:** Mr. Kirkland is “under investigation by the state Ethics Commission, apparently in connection with a tangled web of money and potential conflicts of interest that he helped weave from Harrisburg. The *Daily News* reported in November that since 1998, about \$800,000 in state grants has gone to organizations close to Kirkland's family - including the Baptist church where he is pastor, an annual cultural festival at which his daughter has been paid to sing and an arts center where his wife is president and his son-in-law was executive director.” (*Daily News* Wednesday, February 13, 2013).

**Update:** On November 20, 2014, “the Ethics Commission and Mr. Kirkland entered into a Consent Agreement that stipulated “ Thaddeus Kirkland, D-Delaware County, violated the ethics law by funneling a legislative initiative grant to a nonprofit affiliated with his family. It announced a “consent agreement” in which Mr. Kirkland was to pay \$2,000 in restitution for \$2,000 paid to his daughter. Another stipulation



was that “Kirkland is directed to not accept any reimbursement, compensation or other payment from the Pennsylvania House of Representatives representing a full or partial reimbursement of the amount paid in settlement of this matter.” (Pittsburgh Post Gazette,” Joe Smydo, December 22, 2014).

• **Former Rep. Frank LaGrotta, (D-Lawrence.)**

Mr. LaGrotta served in the House of Representatives from 1987 to 2006. He was defeated in the primary for supporting the legislative pay raise.

Mr. LaGrotta took an extra \$4,414 from the illegal pay raise. He claimed his unvouchered expenses were used to buy a new computer for his office and pay some mileage to his employees. (*Vindy.com*, November 20, 2005).

“After losing the primary in 2006, I decided to stop having the amount of the pay raise deducted from my salary. I also was reimbursed for the months I did pay back. It was perfectly legal, according to House Comptroller Alexis Brown,’ Mr. LaGrotta said yesterday. Earnings from the 2005 pay raise will help boost Mr. LaGrotta's annual pension by roughly \$740 a year, according to estimates by the *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*.” (Clerk’s Office, February 21, 2008 and *Post Gazette*, February 29, 2008).

• **Former Rep. Frank LaGrotta, (D-Lawrence.)**

**Employment history:** Mr. LaGrotta was defeated in the 2006 primary, and was then hired as an “internal adviser” to the House Democratic caucus, “assisting other members as necessary,” (*Herald Standard*, February 16, 2007). Mr. LaGrotta received a salary of \$73,614 as a legislative assistant.

He also voted for the pension increase in 2001, and received a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension** \$3,048.88.

**Lump sum payment:** \$111,754.44.

(RTK Request, April 23, 2012.)

- **Former Rep. Marie A. Lederer, (D- Philadelphia.)**

Rep. Lederer served in the House of Representatives from 1993 to 2006. She retired after supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005. Lederer voted for the pay raise, kept the money, and received a pension bounce.

She also voted for the pension increase in 2001.

**Monthly pension & approximate:** \$3,051.54.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$0.

(Right to Know Request, August 11, 2011)

- **Former Rep Victor John Lescovitz, (D-Washington & Allegheny.)**

Rep. Lescovitz served in the House of Representatives from 1980 to 2006, and retired after supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005. Mr. Lescovitz voted for the pay raise, kept the money, and received a pension bounce.

Mr. Lescovitz also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,896.79.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$117,908.68.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

- **Former Rep. Stephen Maitland, (R-Adams.)**

Mr. Maitland served in the House of Representatives from 1993 to 2006. During that time as a public servant, he earned a law degree at the taxpayers' expense.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

He voted for the pay raise, accepted unvouchered expenses, and used the \$5,148 raise to attend law school. Even though Maitland voted to repeal the raise, he said keeping the money is not hypocritical. "I think it would [be] if the money were merely extra salary. Again, in my case it's actual reimbursement for actual expenses," Maitland said. (WGAL-Channel 8, January 11, 2006).

Mr. Maitland was defeated in the primary of 2006, and even after the Supreme Court declared unvouchered expenses were unconstitutional, said he had no plans to repay the money because he used the money for law school tuition, which he termed a "legitimate reimbursement." (*York Daily Record*, September 15, 2006).

After he lost the election, he claimed \$11,368 in per diems, much of it retroactive, before he left office (*York Daily Record*, January 30, 2007). Mr. Maitland completed law school, and took the bar exam. (Sources: *Patriot-News* and *The Associated Press*).

Mr. Maitland voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Parting shots:** "...Rep. Stephen R. Maitland, R-Adams, defended his vote for the pay raise law that, before it was repealed, gave hefty raises to lawmakers, judges and other high-ranking government officials.

"We are grossly underpaid," he said. "Each and every member in this room is worth what a public school superintendent is worth. I don't regret my pay raise vote one bit."

"Maitland, who expects to finish law school next month, scolded residents of his district for forfeiting his 14 years of seniority."

• **Former Rep. Stephen Maitland, (R-Adams.)**

"In a very short period of time, I'll be making two to three times what a state representative makes. You passed up a bargain," he said. "But then, Adams County Republicans are prone to self-inflicted injury." A few days later, he was having second thoughts about that part of his speech.

"That was over the top," Maitland said. "If I had to do it again, I'd tone it down." ("The Associated Press," Mark Scolforo, November 26, 2006).

**Monthly pension:** \$1,440.60.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$65,686.14.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Rep. Keith McCall, (D-Carbon.)**

Mr. McCall won a House seat in 1982 and replaced his father who had passed away. He held the seat until 2011 and served as Speaker of the House from 2009 to 2011.

As Whip he voted for the pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. Mr. McCall failed to respond to a request for information left at (717)-783-1375 on May 3, 2006 by *RTC*. However, *RTC* did receive an invitation to a \$500-a-plate breakfast fundraiser held in November 2007 and in April 2008.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

After serving as Speaker of the House, Mr. McCall announced his retirement in 2010.

**Update:** In February 2011, Mr. McCall was appointed by the House Democratic Caucus as their representative for a two-year term on the Pennsylvania Gaming Commission. He receives an annual salary of \$145,000.

Mr. McCall was reappointed for an additional two-year term in February 2013.

• **Rep. Keith McCall, (D-Carbon.)**

**Projected annual pension:** His pension was projected to be \$91,000 a year in 2010 prior to being appointed to the Gaming Control Board, but could be in excess of \$101,000 when he retires from the Gaming Control Commission.

• **Rep. Sheila Miller, (R-Berks.)**

Rep. Miller served in the House of Representatives from 1993-2006 and was forced to retire after supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

She also voted for the pension increase in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$2,742.85.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$99,602.96.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Rep. Phyllis Mundy, (D-Kingston.)**

Rep. Mundy was elected in 1991 and is the Democratic Chairwoman of the Finance Committee.

Rep. Mundy voted for the pay raise, voted to repeal the pay raise, but kept the unvouchered expenses she collected.

At the time the vote was cast there had been three court decisions upholding the constitutionality of unvouchered expenses, Mundy said. "There was nothing unconstitutional about what we did. Now the Supreme Court is reversing itself. That does not mean at the time the vote was cast it was improper." (*Times-Leader*, September 16, 2006).

**Pension Pad:** "Rep. Mundy voted against raising legislative pensions by 50%, but said she would accept the increase." (State Employees' Retirement System; *The Morning Call*, Mario F. Cattabianai and David La Torre, July 03, 2001).

Ms. Mundy retired in 2014.

**Monthly pension: \$3,527,72**  
**Full lump-sum withdrawal: \$161,008.18**  
(SERS RTK Request data received on June 30, 2015.)

• **Former Rep. John L. Myers, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Myers has served in the House of Representatives from 1995 to 2013. Mr. Myers voted 'no' on the pay-raise bill, but accepted unvouchered expenses.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001 and retired in 2013.

**Monthly pension: \$3,834.69.**  
**Full lump-sum withdrawal: \$106,321.46.**  
(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Former Rep. Frank Oliver, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Oliver served in the House of Representatives from 1973 to 2010. He voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and still took the money.

"Oliver said he voted for the raise, he took the money, he deserved the money, he worked hard for it, his constituents knew he worked hard for it, and he wasn't in any way ashamed of voting for the raise or taking it. 'If that pay-raise issue came up tomorrow, I would support it,' he said. 'I know I deserve it. Most members deserve it. We're underpaid as it is.'" *(Philadelphia Inquirer, Angela Coulombis and Marc Schogo, September 16, 2006).*

Mr. Oliver voted to increase his pension in 2001, and is in a special class when it comes to pension benefits covered by a pension system in effect before 1974.

This system requires a higher "multiplier" to calculate benefits for the pre-1974 class than for lawmakers elected since that year.

• **Former Rep. Frank Oliver, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Oliver's pension is calculated based on his 40 years in office, a 7.5 % multiplier of the average salary of the three highest years and other factors. The 7.5% multiplier enjoyed by lawmakers elected before 1974 is compared to a 3% multiplier for lawmakers elected after 1974 and a 2.5% multiplier for state employees.

**Monthly pension: \$23,841.66.**  
(Taxpayers United, 2012.)  
**Lump-sum withdrawal: \$416,000.**  
(“Tracking large government pensions,” February 15, 2011.)

• **Former Rep. John Perzel, (R-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Perzel served in the House of Representatives from 1979 until 2010. He was the Whip from 1989 to 1994, Party Leader from 1995 to 2003 and Speaker of the House of Representatives 2003 to 2006.

Mr. Perzel was defeated in 2010 after being indicted.

**Cows:** The former Speaker of the House defended the pay raise scheme based on his belief that farm workers in Lancaster County and tattoo artists in Philadelphia made wages comparable to state legislators.

**Mayfair Corporation:** Over an eight-year period, Mr. Perzel funneled about \$8.8 million in special state grants to non-profits he supported like the Mayfair Community Development Corporation. In addition to the John M. Perzel Community Center in Northeast Philadelphia, the former Lord of the Philadelphia Parking Authority made sure his campaign committee collected a minimum of \$25,000 from PPA employees and consultants from 2002-2007." (Pittsburgh Tribune, Brad Bumsted and Deb Erdley, April 24, 2006).

**Ripping off the taxpayer:** "Majority Leader John Perzel of Philadelphia also tapped the fund for \$1.1 million to pay a company to collect detailed voter registration data and to conduct phone surveys that even some Republicans say were designed to give incumbent Republicans an edge in their reelection campaigns.

"Perzel used the same fund to pay a Pittsburgh law firm \$1.4 million, partly for legal research aimed at helping a Republican representative who had been convicted of a felony. The research was meant to bolster Republican arguments that the legislator could not be forced to resign without a vote to expel him, even though the state constitution requires expulsion.

"The money came from Perzel's Special Leadership Account, one of four such expense accounts used by Democratic and Republican leaders in the Senate and House, ostensibly to pay legislative expenses of their party caucuses. Details of how the money is used are shrouded in secrecy." (Post- Gazette Harrisburg, John M.R. Bull, Sunday, August 06, 2000).

**Sentence:** On March 21, 2012, Mr. Perzel was sentenced to 2.5 to 5 years in prison for approving the state's purchase of \$10 million in sophisticated computer programs used for Republican political campaigns. Perzel will be eligible for parole in February 2014.

**Fines and restitution:** Dauphin County Court Judge, Richard A. Lewis, ordered Mr. Perzel to pay \$30,000 in fines and \$1 million in restitution payments.

Mr. Perzel also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Pension:** As a result of the criminal conviction, Mr. Perzel forfeited his annual pension. He was receiving an annual pension of \$85,653.24.

However, Mr. Perzel was allowed to keep his lump sum withdrawal of \$209,936.03. (SERS Right to Know Request, August 11, 2011.)

**Incarceration:** Mr. Perzel was interned for just under two years at Laurel Highlands State Correctional Institution for misusing public money and was paroled on February 27, 2014.

**Monthly pension:** \$7,137.77.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$209,936.03.

(Right to Know Request, August 11, 2011.)

• **Former Rep. Bill Rieger, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Rieger served the 179th legislative district from 1966 to 2006, and only passed two bills into law over a 40-year career.

**Crime watch:** "In 2004, Mr. Rieger drew scrutiny for being recorded as voting on a number of measures while traveling by car back to his North Philadelphia district...He admitted wedging a piece of paper into the "yea" button in the voting apparatus that each House member uses so that he would be recorded as voting in favor of several measures even though he was absent." (Inquirer, December 14, 2009).

Mr. Rieger voted to increase his pension. "Rep. William W. Rieger (D-Philadelphia) will see a bounce of \$5,400 for an annual pension of \$77,600. (Philadelphia Inquirer, March 26, 2006).

Mr. Rieger voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

Mr. Rieger passed away in 2009.

**Monthly pension:** \$9,575.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$369,000.

(The Associated Press, February 8, 2007.)

• **Former Rep. Larry Roberts, (D-Fayette.)**

Mr. Roberts served in the House of Representatives from 1993 to 2006, and was forced to retire after supporting the legislative pay raise.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

“Rep. Lawrence Roberts (D-Fayette) will realize an annual pension boost of \$721.”  
(Philadelphia Inquirer, March 26, 2006).

**Monthly pension:** \$1,680.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$65,550.51.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

• **Former Rep. T.J. Rooney, (D-Northampton.)**

Mr. Rooney served in the House of Representatives from 1993 -2006, and was forced to retire for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

Mr. Rooney said he would not pay the unvouchered expenses back unless the Supreme Court deems the measure unconstitutional. "The Supreme Court of Pennsylvania has taken another view on several occasions. Until the Supreme Court tells me differently, I will follow the law of Pennsylvania." (Morning Call, Harrisburg Bureau, November 17, 2005).

**Promise-breaker:** After the “Supreme Court told Mr. Rooney differently,” he went back on his word and kept the cash. Rooney retired as head of the Democratic Party of Pennsylvania.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$1,264.42.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$66,135.46.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)



- **Former Rep. Ken Ruffing, (D-Allegheny.)**

Mr. Ruffing served in the House of Representatives from 1999-2006 and was defeated in the primary for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

Mr. Ruffing voted for the raise, took the money and did not pay it back. RockTheCapital.org called his office on May 3, 2006. Ruffing, who was on the House floor, did not return the call. Mr. Ruffing refused to disclose the autism charities to which he claimed he had donated the unvouchered expenses after the Pittsburgh Post-Gazette contacted several organizations. The groups claimed they had not received any money from Rep. Ruffing.

After loosing an election, Mr. Ruffing was appointed to a temporary advisory role for three months by democratic leadership. "Kenneth Ruffing received an \$18,120 contract to serve as a 'special assistant' in the caucus." (Shamrock Times, March 11, 2007).

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a "pension bounce."

**Monthly pension:** \$318.76.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$42,353.11.

(SERS response to Right-to-Know Request, August 11, 2011.)

- **Rep. Chris Sainato, (D-Lawrence.)**

Mr. Sainato was elected in 1995. He voted 'no' but took the raise, kept the money, and was removed from his subcommittee chair.

"Sainato said he initially promised the money to the New Castle Playhouse for a scholarship fund." (Vindy.com, Sunday, November 20, 200).

Rep. Sainato collected \$49,140 in per diems from 2004-2005 for 369 work days (Pittsburgh Tribune, April 30, 2006. He was crowned the Per Diem King in 2014. "The Lawrence County Democrat raked in 192 per diem reimbursements totaling \$29,254, records show." ("The Morning Call," Steve Esack and Eugene Tauber, November 17, 2014).

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

• **Former Rep. Larry Sather, (R-Huntingdon.)**

Mr. Sather served in the House of Representatives from 1993 to 2006, and was forced to retire for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005. Mr. Sather voted for the pay raise and kept the money.

Mr. Sather voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$2,285.01.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$0.

(SERS response to RTC's Right-to-Know Request, August 11, 2011.)

• **Former Rep. James E. Shaner, (D-Fayette.)**

Mr. Shaner served in the House of Representatives from 1995 to 2006, and retired due to health reasons.

He voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

Mr. Shaner voted 'no' on the pay-raise bill but accepted unvouchered expenses so that he could collect the extra money immediately. He donated the pay to charity and received a pension bounce. His annual pension boost as a result of taking the money was \$456. (Philadelphia Inquirer, March 26, 2006).

Mr. Shaner passed away on April 15, 2012.

**Monthly pension:** \$4,257.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$153,000.

(The Associated Press, February 8, 2007). =

• **Former Rep. Edward Staback, (D-Lackawanna.)**

Mr. Staback was elected in 1985 and retired in 2012. Rep. Staback voted to increase his salary from \$69,647.64 to \$89,154 during the pay raise vote.

**Perks:** "I do not take advantage of any of this," said Rep. Ed Staback. "I don't consider myself a spendthrift. I spend money as I need to spend it, when I need to spend it." He collected \$26,745 in per-diems during the 18 months reviewed and billed the House \$585 a month for a private lease on a 2005 Dodge Durango." (Shamrock Times, November 13, 2006).

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$4,027.83.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$177,712.81.

SERS Response to RTK Request, June 30, 2014.

• **Former Rep. Stephen Stetler, (D-York.)**

Mr. Stetler served in the House of Representatives from 1991 to 2006. He retired in 2006, and was named Secretary of Revenue by Governor Rendell in 2008. Mr. Stetler was unanimously confirmed by the Senate on March 31, 2009. He resigned that position on December 15, 2009, the same day he was indicted by Attorney General Tom Corbett.

**Conviction:** On June 27, 2007, Mr. Stetler was convicted of conflict of interest, criminal conspiracy and the felonies of theft by unlawful taking, theft by deception, theft of services and theft by failure to make required disposition by a Dauphin County Jury. He was sentenced 1.5 to 5 years in prison. The Court fined Mr. Stetler \$35,000 and ordered him to pay \$466,621 in restitution.

**Initial Appeal:** “The judge who presided over former state Rep. Stephen Stetler's corruption trial last year has responded to the incarcerated politician's appeal, saying the court acted properly and the judgment against Stetler should be affirmed.”

“A jury on June 27, 2012, found Stetler guilty of six felony offenses related to misappropriation of taxpayer-funded resources.

“The jurors found that between 2004 and 2006, the 15-year incumbent Democrat used state employees to campaign and raise money for himself and other politicians. The employees were on the clock for legislative matters.

“In a 43-page opinion filed Aug. 16, Dauphin County President Judge Todd A. Hoover listed 16 points on which he acted according to law.” (The York Dispatch, Christina Kauffman, August 30, 2013).

**Final Appeals:** “The state Supreme Court refused Thursday to hear an appeal former state Revenue Secretary Stephen Stetler filed to try to overturn his public corruption conviction, prison term and \$500,000 in fines and restitution.

“A Dauphin County jury convicted Stetler, a Democratic former state representative from York County and one-time chairman of the House Democratic Campaign Committee, in 2012. He was sentenced to 1 1/2 to 5 years in state prison.

“State prosecutors said Stetler illegally used state resources and workers to mount political campaigns.

“The failed appeal the 65-year-old Stetler lodged with the state's highest court challenged a June 2014 ruling by the state Superior Court that upheld his conviction and punishment.

“Stetler, who was revenue secretary during the Rendell administration, was the last of more than 20 Republican and Democratic state officials who were convicted or pleaded guilty in a string of government corruption cases that began in 2007 with the Bonusgate scandal.

“Mr. Stetler was paroled from his prison term in February 2014.” (“Penn Live,” Matt Miller, January 22, 2015).

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Annual pension:** \$45,516.

(In April 2011, Mr. Stetler forfeited his pension under Act 140.)

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$75,758.

Mr. Stetler was able to keep his lump sum withdrawal.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, April 18, 2011.)

• **Rep. P. Mike Sturla, (D-Lancaster.)**

Mr. Sturla was elected in 1991 and is the Democratic Policy Committee Chairman.

Mr. Sturla voted for the pay raise, kept the cash, and then donated the money to “undisclosed charities.” His raise cost taxpayers more than \$5,100. “Not being an independently wealthy person,” he wrote to us, “it is unrealistic to believe that I would be able to donate all the money to local charities AND also send an equivalent amount to the state.”

Asked to expand on that point, Sturla wrote, “... I would have to go to a bank and take out a personal loan for an additional \$4,000 dollars in order to send money to the state.” (Lancaster New Era, September 29, 2006).

Mr. Sturla garnered infamy for having a golf tournament on the very day 24,000 state workers were laid off. Sturla’s response? “Well, I would have laid off more people had we not gone through with the event, the people that were running the event.” (WGAL Channel 8, July 11, 2007).

**Nonprofit:** “Six Pennsylvania lawmakers have steered almost \$29 million in taxpayer money to nonprofit groups controlled, created or fostered by those same politicians... ‘The idea that I could take (a state grant) and start a nonprofit came from Representative Veon,’ said state Rep. Mike Sturla, D-Lancaster. Sturla formed Lancaster Investment in a Vibrant Economy (LIVE) in 2004 with \$500,000 in special state grants.

“Sturla's organization has a six-member community board and one employee. He said LIVE serves as a clearinghouse for community groups seeking state grants and loans.” (Pittsburgh Tribune Review, Brad Bumsted and Debra Erdley, April 24, 2006).

Mr. Sturla voted to increase his pension in 2001.

• **Former Rep. Elinor Z. Taylor, (R-Chester.)**

Rep. Taylor served the District from 1977 to 2006. She voted for the pay raise. "'That's the way the system works,' said Taylor, 84. 'I worked hard for my pension.'" (Philadelphia Inquirer, March 26, 2006).

Rep. Keller voted to increase her pension in 2001.

Rep. Taylor retired in 2006.

She voted to increase her pension, and received a pension bounce.

Rep. Elinor Z. Taylor (R-Chester) donated her raise of approximately \$12,000 to charity and will experience a \$9,500 pension bounce (Philadelphia Inquirer, March 26, 2006).

Ms. Taylor passed away at age 89 in 2010.

**Monthly pension:** \$10,908.

**Approximate lump-sum withdrawal:** \$187,000.

(Associated Press, February 8, 2007.)

• **Rep. John Taylor, (R-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Taylor was elected in 1985, voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and took the money.

Mr. Taylor was elected Chairman of the Philadelphia Republican City Committee in 2013.

He voted to increase his pension in 2001.

• **Rep. W. Curtis Thomas, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Thomas was elected to the House of Representatives in in 1989.

He voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and took the money.

Mr. Thomas also voted to increase his pension in 2001.

- **Former Rep. Tom Tighe, (D-Luzerne.)**

Mr. Tighe served in the House of Representatives from January 6, 1981, to November 30, 2006, when he was forced to retire for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005.

Mr. Tighe voted for the pay raise, took the money, voted to repeal the pay raise, and retired.

He voted to increase his pension in 2001, and received a pension bounce.

**Monthly pension:** \$3,864.34.

**Full lump-sum withdrawal:** \$112,724.17.

(SERS Response to RTK Request, June 11, 2013.)

- **Former Rep. Mike Veon, (D-Beaver.)**

Mr. Veon was first elected in 1985 and defeated in 2006 for supporting the legislative pay raise of 2005. The former Minority Whip voted for the pay raise and opposed the repeal.

**BIG:** On March 25, 2009, Attorney General Corbett filed additional charges of corruption, unrelated to the previous charges against Mike Veon. The 25-count indictment includes theft, conflict of interest and criminal conspiracy relating to the nonprofit Beaver Initiative for Growth, which was founded by Veon and former state Senator Gerald LaValle in 1992. BIG amassed \$10.6 million in taxpayer funded WAMs, and LaValle and Veon were the only board members.

**Conviction:** Mike Veon was convicted on March 23, 2010 on 14 charges related to his role in paying taxpayer-funded bonuses for state employees to work on his campaign and more than a dozen others. He must also pay \$37,000 in fines and \$100,000 restitution.

**Crime Watch:** On June 19, 2012, Veon was sentenced to an additional 1 to 4 years in prison a separate conviction for misusing state funds at a nonprofit organization he once ran. "Dauphin County Judge Bruce Bratton on Tuesday sentenced the one-time House majority whip to a prison term of one to four years, fined him \$1,500 and ordered him to pay \$119,000 in restitution. He also sentenced the longtime Beaver County lawmaker to four years' probation once he is released."

"Veon was sent to prison for his 2010 conviction for misusing public resources, including more than \$1 million in taxpayers' money paid out in bonuses to reward legislative employees for campaign work. He still owes nearly \$2 million in restitution, according to his lawyer." (Associated Press, June 19, 2012.)

Mr. Veon voted to increase his pension in 2001.

Mr. Veon cashed out with a \$126,614 pension pay out, and receives an annual pension of \$50,340. (Post-Gazette, April 7, 2007).

Veon, who started collecting his pension in early 2007, received a \$126,614 lump sum when he lost reelection. Mr. Veon was ordered to pay \$100,000 in restitution and \$37,000 in fines.

“The Public Employee Pension Forfeiture Act requires lawmakers and other state workers to give up their pensions if they are convicted of certain crimes and if those illegal activities were job-related.” (Pittsburgh Post-Gazette, June 29, 2010).

**Appeal and restitution:** “A former state House Democratic leader serving a prison term for corruption lost his latest appeal, but may have won a reduction in the \$136,000 he's supposed to pay in restitution.

“A three-judge panel of the state Superior Court ruled Friday that the judge at one of the two trials at which Mike Veon was convicted miscalculated how much Veon should pay.” (“Associated Press,” February 7, 2015).

Mr. Veon resided at the State Correctional Institute in the Laurel Highlands for five years, before being paroled on June 18, 2015.

• **Rep. Ronald Waters, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Waters has been a member of the House of Representatives since 1999, and voted for the raise, voted to repeal the raise, and then took the money. "From what I understand the legislation doesn't ask for that, but if my constituents want me to give the money back that's what I'll do," said state Rep. Ronald Waters, D-191..." (Delco Times, November 11, 2005).

Mr. Waters voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Crime Watch:** As part of a Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's sting operation, four state representatives were allegedly caught on tape taking money: Ronald Waters, who allegedly accepted multiple payments totaling \$7,650; Vanessa Brown, who allegedly took \$4,000; Michelle Brownlee, who allegedly received \$3,500; and Louise Bishop, who allegedly accepted \$1,500, and a former Traffic Court judge, Thomasine Tynes.

**Update:** Philadelphia State Representatives Ronald Waters, Vanessa Lowery Brown, and former State Representative Harold James entered pleas to accepting cash in violation of state ethics laws, resulting from a sting operation by a lobbyist informant. Waters resigned his House seat on June 1, 2015, and pled guilty to nine counts of conflict of interest. James also pled guilty to one count of the same and both will serve probation.

State Representative Vanessa Lowery Brown did not accept a plea deal and opted for her day in court.

Mr. Waters voted to increase his pension in 2001.

Based on a RTK Request filed by Rock the Capital, Mr. Waters retirement was based on the following data supplied by SERS on April 6, 2015:

- Class of service and associated multiplier: D4 and 1.5.
- Number of years of accredited service: 15.567.
- Three highest years of retirement coverage compensation.

2013: \$95,577.32

2014: \$94,925.76

2012: \$83,153.72

• **Former Rep. Jewell Williams, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Williams served in the House of Representatives from 2001 to 2012, and was elected sheriff of Philadelphia on November 9, 2011.

Rep. Williams voted for the raise and kept the cash. "I'm going to give it back when a bill is passed that says we have to give it back." (Philadelphia Inquirer, December 1, 2005).

Mr. Williams voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Monthly pension:** \$1,729.91.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$70,875.12.

• **Rep. Rosita Youngblood, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Rep. Youngblood was elected the House Representatives in 1994.

Rep. Youngblood voted for the raise and took it. "I work almost seven days a week," Youngblood said. She says she dips into her own pocket to help constituents when they do not have money for such necessities as food or air conditioners and will continue to do so." (Philadelphia Inquirer, August 2, 2005).

Mr. Youngblood voted to increase her pension in 2001.



## Summary of the Senate

In the Senate, five sitting members kept unvouchered expenses, including David Argall (R-Schuylkill), Vincent J. Hughes (D-Philadelphia), Shirley M. Kitchen (D-Philadelphia), Christine Tartaglione (D-Philadelphia), and Anthony H. Williams (D-Philadelphia.)

Three senators who paid the money back, former-Sen. Vince Fumo, Sen. Joseph Scarnatti, and Sen. John Wozniak, owe the IRS imputed interest payments.

In the Senate, repayments were made through salary reduction, and can be verified through a request with the Chief Clerk's office. The following senators refused to return the unconstitutional pay raise:

|   |                  |
|---|------------------|
| • David Argall, (R-Schuylkill)            | Owes \$7,000.00  |
| • Charles D. Lemmond, (R-Luzerne) (1)     | Owes \$7,708.54  |
| • Vincent J. Hughes, (D-Philadelphia)     | Owed \$7,708.54  |
| • Shirley M. Kitchen, (D-Philadelphia)    | Owes \$7,708.54  |
| • Robert J. Mellow, (D-Lackawana) (2)     | Owes \$13,380.56 |
| • Raphael J. Musto, (D-Luzerne) (3)       | Owed \$7,708.54  |
| • Christine Tartaglione, (D-Philadelphia) | Owes \$7,708.54  |
| • Anthony H. Williams, (D-Philadelphia)   | Owes \$7,708.54  |

---

1 Mr. Lemmond retired with a pension bounce. He passed away on May 30, 2012.

2 Former Senator Robert Mellow pension was terminated by the SERS on May 9, 2012. He is appealing the decision.

3 Mr. Musto passed away on April 24, 2014.

## Senate by the Numbers

The following is a recap of state senators' actions regarding repayment of the pay raise.

- **Senator David Argall, (R-Schuylkill & Berks Counties.)**

Mr. Argall did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Mr. Argall was House Whip when he accepted unvouchered expenses. According to Rep. Argall, all \$7,000 of the unvouchered cash was donated to the United Way (Morning Call, Harrisburg Bureau, November 17, 2005), and he told the Republican Herald that he reported the "income and took a deduction on his federal tax for the charitable donation."

As State House Minority Whip David Argall's expense records revealed that Mr. Argall collected an exorbitant amount of supplemental, tax-free income in the form of "per diems." A thorough review of Rep. Argall's expenses for the period 2005 through 2007 indicates he routinely collected the maximum per diem allowable even as he assumed his duties on the Speaker's Commission on Legislative Reform.

As a House member, Mr. Argall voted to increase his pension in 2001.

- **Former Senator Vincent Fumo, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Fumo served in the Senate from 1978 to 2008, voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted "unvouchered expenses." Mr. Fumo said the monetary expense of the pay raise is minor compared to the loss of time spent on the legislation and the damage the controversy has caused to the fabric of the Legislature. Fumo said, "In the end, the people of Pennsylvania are going to suffer far more than the pay raise has cost them," (Associated Press and Patriot News, November 16, 2005.)

Mr. Fumo repaid \$12,413.86 over three years. Three other senators with repayment schedules 34 months or longer are: Sen. Terry Punt, \$7,708 (deceased); Sen. Joseph Scarnatti, \$14,553; and Sen. John Wozniak, \$7,708.

Senators, who arranged to pay the money back over a three-year period, owe imputed interest on the following implied and tax-free loans. The imputed interest from July 7 and November 16, 2005, was 4.58%, based on the IRS ruling on employers in Pub. 15:

In general, if an employer lends an employee more than \$10,000 at an interest rate less than the current applicable federal rate (AFR), the difference between the interest paid and the interest that would be under the AFR is considered additional compensation to the employee. This rule applies to a loan of \$10,000 or less if one of its principal purposes is the avoidance of federal tax.

February 6, 2007: Senator Vincent Fumo (D-Philadelphia) was indicted by the federal government on 139 counts, including numerous counts of felonious use of taxpayers' funds and legislative staff for personal purpose as well as fraud.

March 16, 2009: Vince Fumo was convicted of 137 corruption counts, including defrauding the Senate of about \$1.3 million, a South Philadelphia nonprofit of \$960,000 and the Independence Seaport Museum of \$128,000.

Mr. Fumo voted to increase his pensions in 2001.

**Pension:** After 30 years in the Senate, Mr. Fumo started collecting a monthly pension of \$8,371.58, beginning on December 1, 2008.

He forfeited his pension under Act 140 on July 14, 2009.

**Lump sum payment:** \$0.  
(SERS RTK Request, July 24, 2012).

Mr. Fumo was released from a federal prison in Kentucky in August 2013. The former Senator has paid full restitution of \$1.4 million. ("Penn Live," Matt Miller and Jan Murphy, October 18, 2013).

• **Senator Vincent Hughes, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Hughes served in the House from 1987 to 1994, and moved on to the Senate in 1994.

Senator Hughes voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. Senators Vincent J. Hughes and Joseph B. Scarnatti have seen their salaries soar to \$106,986, or 54% - a far bigger percentage boost than any other legislator gets.

Mr. Hughes did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Under a little-noticed provision, the pay-raise law gives Senate deputy whips - new positions now held by Hughes and Scarnati - the same pay as those in certain other long-standing leadership posts. Their pay rose so sharply because, unlike other ranking members, they had been collecting the base legislative pay of \$69,648 before the new law. (Philadelphia Inquirer, September 3, 2005).

Mr. Hughes voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Ethics violations:** On January 21, 2009, the City of Philadelphia's Board of Ethics announced two settlements involving City Councilman Curtis Jones, Jr. and Senator Vincent Hughes.

"...the ethics board announced yesterday that Jones had agreed to pay \$22,500 in fines for 23 campaign-finance violations, and that Hughes had agreed to pay \$7,500 in penalties for seven violations.

"Board of Ethics Chairman Richard Glazer said the two settlement agreements reached with Jones and Hughes represented 'a total capitulation' from them. He singled out the pact with the councilman as "admissions of fairly egregious conduct." (Philadelphia Inquirer, January 22, 2009).

• **Senator Shirley Kitchen, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Ms. Kitchen did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Ms. Kitchen voted against the pay-raise bill on July 7, 2005, but accepted the unvouchered expenses.

Senator Kitchen also voted to increase her pension in 2001.

• **Former Senator Charles Lemmond, (R-Luzerne.)**

Senator Lemmond served in the Senate from 1985 to 2006.

Mr. Lemmond voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. He retired after his term expired at the end of 2006. Mr. Lemmond did not repay unvouchered expenses he accepted.

He also voted to increase his pension in 2001, and retired with a pension bounce.

Mr. Lemmond passed away on May 30, 2012.

**Monthly pension:** \$4,520.13.

**Lump-sum withdrawal:** \$0.

(SERS, Right-to-Know Request, July 19, 2010.)

- **Former Senator Robert Mellow, (D-Lackawanna.)**

Mr. Mellow served in the Senate from 1970 to 2010 before stepping down under a cloud of controversy.

Mr. Mellow voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. "There is no reason legally why I should give it back, so I'm not," said Senate Minority Leader Robert J. Mellow. The raises were established law for four months, and similar ones were upheld by the courts, he added. (Philadelphia Inquirer, December 1, 2005).

Mr. Mellow did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Mr. Mellow's annual salary of \$110,350 since 2008 is based on his leadership position as Senate minority leader. Sen. Mellow is in a special class when it comes to pension benefits covered by a pension system in effect before 1974. This system requires a higher "multiplier" to calculate benefits for the pre-1974 class than for lawmakers elected since that year.

Mr. Mellow's pension will be calculated based on his 40 years in office, a 7.5 % multiplier of the average salary of the three highest years and other factors. The 7.5% multiplier enjoyed by lawmakers elected before 1974 is compared to a 3% multiplier for lawmakers elected after 1974 and a 2.5% multiplier for state employees.

Mr. Mellow vacated his seat in 2010.

"Former Senate Democratic leader Robert Mellow on Wednesday pleaded guilty to using Senate staffers for his campaigns -- the 32nd person charged in northeastern Pennsylvania corruption prosecutions that have convicted judges, contractors and county and school officials. Mellow, 69, pleaded guilty in Scranton to a federal conspiracy charge for the campaigning and to filing a false tax return. He faces a maximum five-year prison sentence and \$250,000 fine." (Pittsburgh Tribune-Review, May 9, 2012).

Senator Mellow voted to increase his pension in 2001.

"Mr. Mellow and seven others were charged in a 'pay to play' case involving the Pennsylvania Turnpike. "Attorney General Kathleen Kane said the eight are accused of criminal activity for their financial and political advantage. A grand jury heard evidence that cash, travel, entertainment and political contributions were secretly provided to public officials and political groups by turnpike vendors and their consultants, Kane's office said in a news release." (Associate Press, March 13, 2014).

November, 2013: Mr. Mellow was released from a medium-security federal prison in Georgia, and relocated to halfway house in Scranton to serve out the remainder of his prison sentence, which ended on March 15, 2014.

**Pension:** On June 15, 2012, SERS decided that Mr. Mellow's guilty plea would result in the forfeiture of his pension. SERS has been paying out a total of \$20,510.29 in monthly benefits, of which \$11,579.91 went to Mellow, and \$8,930.38 went to his former wife.

Mr. Mellow is appealing the SERS decision.

Mr. Mellow was able to keep his lump sum withdrawal of \$331,025.14. (RTK Request, April 23, 2012).

**Restitution:** Robert Mellow, former state senator, paid the entire amount in restitution he owed: \$79,806. ("Penn Live," Matt Miller and Jan Murphy, October 18, 2013).

- Former Senator Raphael Musto, (D-Luzerne.)

Mr. Musto served in the Senate from 1982 to 2010. Mr. Musto vacated his seat in 2010.

Mr. Musto voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. "When the pay raise issue first came up I felt in my case it was justified and I voted for it," Musto said. "This issue varied throughout the state. In some areas of the state it was unpopular, in some areas it was mediocre and in some areas it was not an issue" (Citizens Voice, November 3, 2005).

Mr. Musto did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Crime Watch: "A federal grand jury has indicted longtime state Sen. Raphael J. Musto, the latest legislator to be caught up in an overlapping series of corruption investigations. The indictment announced Tuesday alleges that Mr. Musto, D-Luzerne, accepted bribes, gifts and construction work from an unnamed contractor in return for his help in obtaining state grants and loans." (Inquirer Harrisburg Bureau, November 24, 2010).

Mr. Musto voted to increase his pension in 2001.

**Pension:** Sen. Raphael Musto retired at the end of 2010 and was collecting a \$127,032 annual pension. He did not withdraw a lump sum payment from the State Employees' Retirement System.

Mr. Musto passed away on April 24, 2014.

• **Senator Joe Scarnati, (R-Jefferson.)**

Mr. Scarnati ran as an independent and won a special election for the Senate in 2001. He became President Pro Tempore of the Senate in 2007 and served as Lt. Governor from 2008 to 2011 after the death of Catherine Baker Knoll. As President Pro Tempore, Mr. Scarnati made \$126,996 per year.

“Senate Republicans had no such position until the pay raise. Scarnati was appointed several weeks after the raises became law.” (Philadelphia Inquirer, September 3, 2005).

Under a little-noticed provision, the pay-raise law gives Senate deputy whips -- new positions now held by Hughes and Scarnati -- the same pay as those in certain other long-standing leadership posts. Their pay rose so sharply because, unlike other ranking members, they had been collecting the base legislative pay of \$69,648 before the new law.

Mr. Scarnati repaid \$14,553 over three years. Three other senators with repayment schedules 34 months or longer are: Sen. Vincent Fumo: \$12,413.86 , Sen. Terry Punt: \$7,708; and Sen. John Wozniak: \$7,708.

Senators who arranged to pay the money back over a three-year period owe imputed interest on the following implied and tax-free loans. The imputed interest from July 7 to November 16, 2005, was 4.58% based on the IRS ruling on employers in Pub. 15:

In general, if an employer lends an employee more than \$10,000 at an interest rate less than the current applicable federal rate (AFR), the difference between the interest paid and the interest that would be paid under the AFR is considered additional compensation to the employee. This rule applies to a loan of \$10,000 or less if one of its principal purposes is the avoidance of federal tax.

Mr. Scarnati voted to increase his pension in 2001.

In November 2006, Mr. Scarnati was elected President pro tempore.

• **Senator Christine Tartaglione, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Sen. Tartaglione has been a member the Senate since 1995.

Ms. Tartaglione voted against the pay-raise bill on July 7, 2005, but accepted the unvouchered expenses. Sen. Christine Tartaglione did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Senator Christine Tartaglione voted to increase her pension in 2001.

- **Senator Anthony Williams, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Williams served the House from 1989 to 1998, and was elected to the Senate in 1999; he is the Senate Democratic Whip.

Senator Williams did not repay unvouchered expenses.

Mr. Williams voted for the 2005 pay raise and accepted unvouchered expenses. Senator Anthony H. Williams, said he had already spent the money. "I paid my bills," he said, adding that it wasn't his intent to enroll in a 12-month refund program.

He said he'd have an aide research how much he received. After voting for the raise and the unvouchered expenses, he said he only voted for the repeal because his caucus asked him to do that. Williams explained that he believed a legislator should be compensated for the service provided (The Daily Times, December 2, 2005).

Mr. Williams voted to increase his pension in 2001.

- **Sen. John Wozniak, (D-Cambria.)**

Mr. Wozniak served the House from 1981 to 1996 and was elected to the Senate in 1997.

Senator Wozniak voted for the 2005 pay raise, and accepted "unvouchered expenses."

Mr. Wozniak repaid \$7,708.54 over three years. Three other senators with repayment schedules 34 months or longer are: Sen. Vincent Fumo \$12,413.86, Sen. Terry Punt, \$7,708; and Sen. Joseph Scarnatti, \$14,553.

Senators, who arranged to pay the money back over a three-year period, owe imputed interest on the following implied and tax-free loans. The imputed interest from July 7 to November 16, 2005, was 4.58% based on the IRS ruling on employers in Pub. 15:

In general, if an employer lends an employee more than \$10,000 at an interest rate less than the current applicable federal rate (AFR), the difference between the interest paid and the interest that would be paid under the AFR is considered additional compensation to the employee. This rule applies to a loan of \$10,000 or less if one of its principal purposes is the avoidance of federal tax.

Senator John Wozniak, who voted for the pay raise and decided to accept it early as unvouchered expenses, and who bashed legislators who opposed the increase, saying: "They're the ones who voted no and are hiding behind their mothers' skirts. I'm sure there's quite a few of them who crossed their fingers and hoped it would pass without them voting for it" (Centre Daily Times, November 19, 2005).

Mr. Wozniak voted to increase his pension in 2001.



## Crime Watch

Pay-jackers convicted of breaking the law or indicted, investigated, “presented” or searched by city, state and/or federal law enforcement agencies:

- **Former Rep. Linda Bebko-Jones, (D-Erie.)**

8/6/08: Former state lawmaker, Linda Bebko-Jones, an Erie County Democrat, was sentenced in Dauphin County today to 12 months' probation, and escaped jail time after pleading guilty to charges that she forged signatures on her nominating petitions. Associated Press, August 5, 2008. Ms. Bebko-Jones was fined \$1,500 and ordered to perform 200 hours of community service.

Rep. Bebko-Jones passed away on November 20, 2011.

- **Rep. Louise Williams Bishop, (D-Philadelphia.)**

“As part of a Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's sting operation, four state representatives were allegedly caught on tape taking money: Ronald Waters, who allegedly accepted multiple payments totaling \$7,650; Vanessa Brown, who allegedly took \$4,000; Michelle Brownlee, who allegedly received \$3,500; and Louise Bishop, who allegedly accepted \$1,500, and a former Traffic Court judge, Thomasine Tynes.

**Update:** “A judge on Friday rejected a request that he dismiss bribery and other charges against State Rep. Louise Williams Bishop in the sting investigation after her lawyer argued that the case was too old and Bishop's memory too weak.

“Dauphin County Court Judge Scott Evans also turned down Bishop's bid to have any potential trial held in Philadelphia, saying he did not have the authority to make that decision.

“Evans did not rule on Bishop's contention that prosecutors in the sting operation selected their targets based on race and that as a consequence, the entire case should be thrown out.

“Bishop, 81, is among six current or former Democratic elected officials from Philadelphia who were charged with taking money from a lobbyist who sought political and legislative favors. Two former legislators have pleaded guilty, as has a former Traffic Court judge. A fourth is scheduled to appear in court on Monday. All six are black.” (“Philadelphia Inquirer,” Angela Couloumbis and Craig R. McCoy June 7, 2015).

• **Former Rep. Todd Eachus, (D-Luzerne.)**

3/17/12: In the U.S. District Court for the Middle District of Pennsylvania, “Former Majority Leader Todd Eachus of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives and seven staff members of the House Democratic Caucus have been sued by the former controller of the caucus who claims she was fired for testifying about the scandal known as Bonusgate.

“Mary Ann O’Leary, the former controller, says in a federal lawsuit filed March 7 that she testified 14 times before a grand jury investigating Bonusgate, the probe into the use of tax dollars for campaign activities that led to the convictions of former House Speakers John Perzel and William DeWeese and former Democratic Whip Mike Veon.” (Citizens Voice, Kent Jackson, March 17, 2012).

Judge Sylvia Rambo denied the Defendant’s Motion to Dismiss on November 1, 2012.

On September 9, 2013, Judge Joel H. Slomsky issued a Memorandum and Order that Plaintiff’s Motion to overrule objection (Doc. 7) was granted “The Clerk of Court shall file the accompanying opinion under seal until further notification is received by the Court...”

• **Former Rep. William DeWeese, (D-Greene.)**

12/15/09: The Attorney General filed criminal charges against Representative H. William DeWeese.

4/24/12: Former House Majority Leader Bill DeWeese, D-Greene, was sentenced to 2.5 to 5 years in prison after being convicted on five felonies for using his Harrisburg and district office staff for political advancement. Judge Todd Hoover also ordered Mr. DeWeese to pay \$25,000 in fines and court costs and almost \$116,000 in restitution.

Mr. DeWeese was released from prison in March,2014, and is currently on parole.

• **Rep. Dwight Evans, (D-Philadelphia.)**

“A Philadelphia nonprofit with ties to State Rep. Dwight Evans mismanaged \$1.5 million in state grants since 2006, raising questions about how the money was obtained and spent, according to a confidential state audit. At Evans’ direction, the Urban Affairs Coalition put a Philadelphia pastor and his aide on its payroll, the auditors found, then used taxpayer funds to pay them \$365,000 for work that auditors said they could not verify.” (Philadelphia Inquirer, John P. Martin and Angela Couloumbis, November 18, 2012).

Update: "The state investigation ended last year with OARC admitting no wrongdoing but agreeing to return \$1.2 million in taxpayer funds and forgoing an additional \$1.8 million that had already been approved. OARC remains eligible for future funding..."

"Evans founded OARC 30 years ago to advance community development in West Oak Lane, which is in the heart of his district. He is credited with using his position as chairman of the House Appropriations Committee to direct more than \$29 million in state aid to the nonprofit since 2000..."

"The FBI's interest in OARC was confirmed by Meadow, Travick, Germantown publisher Jim Foster, and a Mount Airy property owner who declined to be identified..."

"A confidential report prepared for the state Inspector General's Office alleged that OARC had misspent or mismanaged portions of state grants worth \$12 million since 2006. Investigators concluded that OARC violated bidding rules, made questionable property purchases, and improperly shifted or used grant money between 2006 and 2011..." ("Philadelphia Inquirer," Chris Hepp, August 18, 2014).

• **Former Senator Vincent J. Fumo, (Philadelphia.)**

2/6/07: Senator Vincent Fumo (D-Philadelphia) was indicted by the federal government on 139 counts, including numerous counts of felonious use of taxpayers' funds and using legislative staff for personal purpose as well as fraud.

3/16/09: Vince Fumo was convicted of 137 corruption counts including defrauding the Senate of about \$1.3 million, a South Philadelphia nonprofit of \$960,000 and the Independence Seaport Museum of \$128,000.

5/26/11: "Former Democratic State Sen. Vincent J. Fumo seemed a step closer to a longer prison term after two appellate judges said Wednesday the sentencing of the disgraced politician in 2009 was rife with serious procedural errors..."

11/13/11: Mr. Fumo was re-sentenced to 61 months in prison in a sprawling corruption case, just above the 55-month sentence thrown out by a U.S. appeals court. Prosecutors had sought a guideline sentence of at least 17 years.

Mr. Fumo was released from a federal prison in Kentucky in August 2013.

4/11/14: The Office of Disciplinary Counsel of the Pennsylvania Supreme Court acknowledged Mr. Fumo had voluntarily resigned from the state bar, and had been "disbarred by consent." That disablement is retroactive to January 2010.

- **Rep. Harold James, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Philadelphia State Representatives Ronald Waters, Vanessa Lowery Brown, and former State Representative Harold James entered pleas to accepting cash in violation of state ethics laws, resulting from a sting operation by a lobbyist informant. Waters resigned his House seat on June 1, 2015, and plead guilty to nine counts of conflict of interest. James also pled guilty to one count of the same and both will serve probation.

- **Rep. Bill Keller, (D-Philadelphia.)**

8/18/10: "Action News has learned that federal authorities conducted raids this morning involving Pa. State Representative William Keller. Federal investigators carted out files and cases from a home in Rose Valley, Delaware County. The house belongs to Marty O'Rourke, a campaign aide to State Representative Bill Keller.

"Federal agents also carried out box after box on East Moyamensing Avenue from KO Sporting Goods, a store partially owned by Keller." (WPVI, Offices of State Rep., staffer and judge raided).

"It has been nearly 2.5 years since teams of FBI and IRS agents raided homes and offices in Pennsport connected with state Rep. Bill Keller. So far, three of the 11-term state legislator's close allies have been indicted. (Daily News, January 31, 2013).

April 24, 2013: "The former chief of staff to state Rep. Bill Keller and a longtime business partner for the 11-term legislator pleaded guilty in federal court Wednesday to financial crimes in separate cases. The Daily News predicted those pleas in a story Wednesday.

"Lorraine DiSpaldo, who was forced to retire after being indicted with Traffic Court Judge Robert Mulgrew and his wife on Sept. 13, pleaded guilty to 36 counts for misusing state grant money meant for two non-profits in Keller's district and for filing false income tax returns and bankruptcy court filings. Assistant U.S. Attorney Paul Gray said DiSpaldo improperly spent \$70,000 to \$120,000 in state grant money and hid \$46,779 in income from 2006 to 2009." ("Daily News," Chris Brennan, April 24, 2013).

- **Rep. Thaddeus Kirkland, (D-Delaware.)**

Mr. Kirkland "is under investigation by the state Ethics Commission, apparently in connection with a tangled web of money and potential conflicts of interest that he helped weave from Harrisburg. The Daily News reported in November that since 1998, about \$800,000 in state grants has gone to organizations close to Kirkland's family - including the Baptist church where he is pastor, an annual cultural festival at which his daughter has been paid to sing and an arts center where his wife is president and his son-in-law was executive director." (Daily News Wednesday, February 13, 2013.)

Update: On November 20, 2014, “the Ethics Commission and Mr. Kirkland entered into a Consent Agreement that stipulated “ Thaddeus Kirkland, D-Delaware County, violated the ethics law by funneling a legislative initiative grant to a nonprofit affiliated with his family. It announced a “consent agreement” in which Mr. Kirkland was to pay \$2,000 in restitution for \$2,000 paid to his daughter. Another stipulation was that “Kirkland is directed to not accept any reimbursement, compensation or other payment from the Pennsylvania House of Representatives representing a full or partial reimbursement of the amount paid in settlement of this matter.” (Pittsburgh Post Gazette,” Joe Smydo, December 22, 2014).

• **Senator Vincent Hughes, (D-Philadelphia.)**

On January 21, 2009, the City of Philadelphia's Board of Ethics announced two settlements involving City Councilman Curtis Jones, Jr. and Senator Vincent Hughes.

“In one instance - on primary day, as Jones made his first run for Council - Jones' campaign manager accepted two cash payments totaling \$15,700 from the campaign committee of State Sen. Vincent Hughes, Jones' longtime ally. The money was used to pay election-day workers to distribute 27,300 sample ballots in a heated three-way Council race to succeed Michael Nutter in the Fourth District. Jones won by 470 votes out of 26,000 cast...the ethics board announced yesterday that Jones had agreed to pay \$22,500 in fines for 23 campaign-finance violations, and that Hughes had agreed to pay \$7,500 in penalties for seven violations.

“Board of Ethics Chairman Richard Glazer said the two settlement agreements reached with Jones and Hughes represented "a total capitulation" from them. He singled out the pact with the councilman as "admissions of fairly egregious conduct." (Philadelphia Inquirer, January 22, 2009).

• **Former Rep. Frank LaGrotta, (D-Lawrence.)**

11/14/07: Former-Representative Frank LaGrotta was arraigned on two corruption-related felony charges relating to the Attorney General's investigation of Bonusgate.

2/20/07: Mr. LaGrotta pleaded not guilty to the charges.

“Mr. LaGrotta is the only legislator who began paying back unvouchered expenses and changed his mind. “After losing the primary in 2006, I decided to stop having the amount of the pay raise deducted from my salary. I also was reimbursed for the months I did pay back. It was perfectly legal, according to House Comptroller Alexis Brown,’ Mr. LaGrotta said yesterday.

“Earnings from the 2005 pay raise will help boost Mr. LaGrotta's annual pension by roughly \$740 a year, according to estimates by the Pittsburgh Post-Gazette.” (Clerk’s Office, February 21, 2008 and Post Gazette, February 29, 2008).

2/3/08: Frank LaGrotta pleaded guilty to two felony conflict-of-interest charges for putting his sister and niece on the state payroll in no-work jobs. He was sentenced to six months of house arrest, 30 months of probation and 500 hours of community service. He was also ordered to pay \$27,000 in restitution for the money paid to his relatives and fined \$10,000. Mr. LaGrotta was allowed to keep his pension.

5/5/10: Frank LaGrotta was arrested after he tried to have an altered Xanax prescription filled. "If LaGrotta is ultimately convicted on the new charges, he would then face a state probation revocation hearing, Perry said. Lewis could also re-sentence LaGrotta on the conflict-of-interest convictions if his probation is revoked. (Beaver County Times, June 18, 2010).

6/15/11: On June 15 in New Castle, "Former state Rep. Frank LaGrotta was led from a Lawrence County courtroom in handcuffs Wednesday to begin serving at least three months in the county jail..The former legislator was immediately taken to the Lawrence County Jail, where he will spend between three months and 12 months after pleading guilty to 10 criminal charges in April. On Monday, visiting Senior Judge Eugene Fike II sentenced LaGrotta to jail, ordered him to serve 2 years of probation, and fined him \$1,500 plus court costs on three counts each of acquiring or obtaining a controlled substance by misrepresentation and possession of a

• **Former Sen. Raphael Musto, (D-Luzerne.)**

4/8/10: The FBI searched Mr. Musto's home." Federal agents spent three hours searching the Pittston Township home of state Sen. Raphael Musto today, removing a satellite radio and other items from two vehicles after taking photographs."(Citizens Voice, April 8, 2010).

7/18/10: "A federal grand jury has indicted longtime state Sen. Raphael J. Musto, the latest legislator to be caught up in an overlapping series of corruption investigations. The indictment announced Tuesday alleges that Mr. Musto, D-Luzerne, accepted bribes, gifts and construction work from an unnamed contractor in return for his help in obtaining state grants and loans." (Inquirer Harrisburg Bureau).

11/24/10: "...Sen. Raphael J. Musto was indicted by a federal grand jury Tuesday on charges that he accepted bribes and kickbacks from a construction company and another government official. Musto is alleged to have accepted more than \$35,000 from the construction company for helping it secure government funding. The company was not named in the indictment, but federal agents have been investigating Musto's ties to wealthy Wilkes-Barre developer Robert K. Mericle, who has pleaded guilty in another corruption case Prosecutors allege Musto also accepted \$3,000 from the unnamed official for helping direct loans and grants to several agencies affiliated with the official through the state Department of Environmental Protection." (Citizens Voice, November 24, 2010).

Mr. Musto passed away on April 24, 2014.

• **Former Sen. Robert Mellow, (D-Lackawanna.)**

May 2010: “Federal agents investigating State Sen. Robert J. Mellow, the highest-ranking Senate Democrat, served subpoenas Wednesday on dozens of Democratic staff members, including those in Mellow's Senate office.” (Inquirer Harrisburg Bureau, June 18, 2010).

“The Inquirer reported last year that the Senate spent \$213,000 in state money from 2001 to '06 to rent Mellow's district office from a business half- owned by his then-wife, Diane. After they divorced, her share of the business went to Mellow, and he held it from 2007 until '08.”

5/9/12: “Former Senate Democratic leader Robert Mellow on Wednesday pleaded guilty to using Senate staffers for his campaigns -- the 32nd person charged in northeastern Pennsylvania corruption prosecutions that have convicted judges, contractors and county and school officials.”

He faces a maximum five-year prison sentence and a \$250,000 fine.

3/13/13: “Mr. Mellow and seven others were charged in a ‘pay to play’ case involving the Pennsylvania Turnpike. “Attorney General Kathleen Kane said the eight are accused of criminal activity for their financial and political advantage. A grand jury heard evidence that cash, travel, entertainment and political contributions were secretly provided to public officials and political groups by turnpike vendors and their consultants, Kane's office said in a news release.” (Associate Press, March 13, 2014).

November, 2013: Mr. Mellow was released from a medium-security federal prison in Georgia, and relocated to halfway house in Scranton to serve out the remainder of his prison sentence which ended on March 15, 2014.

• **Former Rep. John Perzel, (R-Philadelphia.)**

11/12/09: Attorney General Tom Corbett announced: “As part of an ongoing public corruption investigation into the Pennsylvania Legislature, agents from the Attorney General's Public Corruption Unit today filed criminal charges against Representative John Perzel and former Republican Representative Brett Feese. Also charged are eight current or former aides to Perzel and Feese. The defendants are each charged with numerous theft, criminal conspiracy and conflict of interest charges.”

On March 21, 2012, Mr. Perzel was sentenced to 2.5 to 5 years in prison for approving the state's purchase of \$10 million in sophisticated computer programs used for Republican political campaigns. Mr. Perzel was paroled in February 2014.

Dauphin County Court Judge Richard A. Lewis ordered Mr. Perzel to pay \$30,000 in fines and \$1 million in restitution payments.

“Former House Speaker John Perzel is serving his prison sentence for misusing public money at Laurel Highlands State Correctional Institution near Somerset, a ‘dormitory-style’ prison for geriatric and sick inmates.” (Pittsburgh Post Tribune, June 15, 2012).

Mr. Perzel was paroled in February 2014.

• **Former Rep. Bill Rieger, (D-Philadelphia.)**

Mr. Rieger served the 179th legislative district from 1966 to 2006, and only passed two bills into law over a 40-year career.

“In 2004, Mr. Rieger drew scrutiny for being recorded as voting on a number of measures while traveling by car back to his North Philadelphia district...He admitted wedging a piece of paper into the "yea" button in the voting apparatus that each House member uses so that he would be recorded as voting in favor of several measures even though he was absent.” (Inquirer, December 14, 2009).

Although Mr. Rieger “ghost-voted” seven times and received a \$126 per diem, the House Ethics Committee cleared the 81-year old legislator and declared: “Rep. Rieger was unaware his votes were being cast during his absence.” (Associated Press, June 25, 2004).

He was the senior member on the Ethics Committee, although he did not participate in the investigation. He voted against the pay raise but took the money and the pension bounce.

• **Former Rep. Stephen Stetler, (D-York.)**

12/15/09: “As part of an ongoing public corruption investigation into the Pennsylvania Legislature, agents from the Attorney General's Public Corruption Unit today filed criminal charges against Representative H. William DeWeese, of Greene County, and former Representative and state Department of Revenue Secretary Stephen Stetler, of York County...Attorney General Tom Corbett said the charges are part of an ongoing grand jury investigation into the misuse of public resources and employees for campaign purposes in the Pennsylvania Legislature.”

“Evidence of the defendants' alleged criminal activity was placed before a statewide investigating grand jury, which recommended that Corbett file criminal charges...The grand jury found that from 2001 until 2007, political fundraising work for DeWeese was conducted from within the Capitol, primarily at taxpayer expense.” (Attorney General's Office, December 15, 2009).



• **Former Rep. Stephen Stetler, (D-York.)**

On June 27, 2007, Mr. Stetler was convicted of conflict of interest, criminal conspiracy and the felonies of theft by unlawful taking, theft by deception, theft of services and theft by failure to make required disposition by a Dauphin County Jury.

2/13/14: Mr. Stetler was released from York County Prison.

6/3/14: The Pennsylvania Superior Court denied former state Rep. Stephen Stetler's appeal of his public corruption conviction

• **Former Rep. Mike Veon, (D-Beaver.)**

7/10/08: Pennsylvania Attorney General Tom Corbett filed criminal charges against 12 individuals, including Mike Veon. Mr. Veon was charged with conflict of interest, theft by unlawful taking or disposition, theft of services, theft by deception, theft by failure to make required disposition of funds.

3/25/09: Attorney General Corbett filed additional charges of corruption, unrelated to the previous charges against Mike Veon. The 25-count indictment includes theft, conflict of interest and criminal conspiracy relating to the nonprofit Beaver Initiative for Growth, which was founded by Veon and former state Senator Gerald LaValle in 1992. BIG amassed \$10.6 million in taxpayer funded WAMs, and LaValle and Mike Veon were the only board members.

3/10/10: "Mike Veon (D-Beaver), former Whip, was convicted on 14 charges related to his role in paying taxpayer-funded bonuses for state employees to work on his campaign and more than a dozen others. He must also pay \$37,000 in fines and \$100,000 restitution.

"Mr. Veon, 53, the former No. 2 Democrat in the state House, was convicted of 14 of 59 counts. He was convicted of seven counts of conflict of interest, three counts of theft by deception, two counts of theft of services and two counts of conspiracy." (Pittsburgh Post-Gazette, March 10, 2010).

6/18/10: Mr. Veon began to serve a six- to 14-year prison sentence. Veon was also stripped of his \$50,340 annual pension.

Mr. Veon is serving a 6 to 14-year sentence but will be eligible for parole in 5 years under the program. Veon lost his seat in 2006 before the law passed and was convicted in 2010 for approving \$1.4 million in taxpayer-paid bonuses to reward staffers for working on political campaigns.

He was convicted in March 2012 of unrelated charges for misusing a nonprofit.

6/19/12: "Former state Rep. Mike Veon was sentenced to an additional 1 to 4 years in prison a separate conviction for misusing state funds at a nonprofit organization he once ran. Dauphin County Judge Bruce Bratton also sentenced Mr. Mr. Veon to four years probation after release from prison, fined him \$1,500 and ordered him to pay \$119,000 in restitution.

"Veon was sent to prison for his 2010 conviction for misusing public resources, including more than \$1 million in taxpayers' money paid out in bonuses to reward legislative employees for campaign work. He still owes nearly \$2 million in restitution, according to his lawyer." (Associated Press, June 19, 2012).

Mr. Veon currently resides at the Laurel Highlands State Correctional Institution.

• **Rep. Ronald Waters, (D-Philadelphia.)**

As part of a Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General's sting operation, four state representatives were allegedly caught on tape taking money: Ronald Waters, who allegedly accepted multiple payments totaling \$7,650; Vanessa Brown, who allegedly took \$4,000; Michelle Brownlee, who allegedly received \$3,500; and Louise Bishop, who allegedly accepted \$1,500, and a former Traffic Court judge, Thomasine Tynes.

Philadelphia State Representatives Ronald Waters, Vanessa Lowery Brown, and former State Representative Harold James entered pleas to accepting cash in violation of state ethics laws, resulting from a sting operation by a lobbyist informant. Waters resigned his House seat on June 1, 2015, and plead guilty to nine counts of conflict of interest. James also pled guilty to one count of the same and both will serve probation.